

New Hampshire's Revised Work Study Practices Collaboration Rubrics

Based on a 2020 Alignment Review by Dr. Karin Hess, Using the *Essential Skills and Dispositions Developmental Framework*¹

“Collaboration incorporates the ability to work across cultural and language differences, as well as the ability to navigate ever-changing virtual spaces that provide continuous opportunities for innovation and adaptation” (*Essential Skills Framework*, p. 2).

Introduction

During the 2020-2021 school years, the New Hampshire Learning Initiative (NHLI), with support from Jobs for the Future (JFF), initiated a study to examine research describing how the personal skills of self-direction and collaboration tend to develop over time. The *Essential Skills and Dispositions Developmental Framework*, in conjunction with other relevant resources, was then used to align and revise NH's Work Study Practices Rubrics for Self-Direction and Collaboration. Part of this work included establishing a common definition for “equitable” collaboration:

Collaboration is an individual's capacity to contribute to, and work with, other people in a process that reflects equity and requires interdependence as they work towards solving a problem, achieving a goal, or completing a project or task.

Performance Level Descriptions in the *Framework* (p. 3) are presented as moving from **Beginners** to **Emerging Experts** as students have opportunities to engage with collaborative tasks. From childhood through adulthood, an individual may fall along different points of a developmental continuum for each component of collaboration. Learners navigate challenges through active tinkering and targeted engagement, leading to more intuitive expression in familiar situations.

- **BEGINNERS** show respect for different perspectives with some support and modeling, care about how others feel, and defer to the group for decision making and task assignment. [NH's rubrics call this level “EMERGING” – describing age-appropriate performance for all grades.]
- **ADVANCED BEGINNERS** remain open to competing ideas from others, avoid conflict, cooperate to keep group work moving forward, and take turns with tasks to be fair. [NH's rubrics call this level “DEVELOPING” – describing age-appropriate performance for all grades.]
- **STRATEGIC LEARNERS** value all group members' perspectives, initiate compromise to move work forward, and build consensus to define roles and tasks that match group members' strengths. [NH's rubrics call this level “APPLYING” – describing age-appropriate performance for all grades.]
- **EMERGING EXPERTS** synthesize a group's best thinking, voice and address power imbalances in a group's dynamic, and anticipate conflicts in order to strengthen group cohesion. [NH's rubrics call this level “EXTENDING” – describing age-appropriate performance for all grades.]

¹ *Essential Skills and Dispositions Developmental Framework*. (2015). National Center for Innovation in Education. <https://www.inflexion.org/essential-skills-and-dispositions-development-frameworks/>

Below are a few other distinctions about these rubrics that users may be interested to know.

- **These rubrics were designed primarily for instruction/formative feedback, peer-assessment, and self-reflection**, and not simply to derive a score by a teacher. This approach makes them more “kid friendly” than many other rubrics. Students who field tested the earlier self-direction rubrics agreed.
- Criteria for **Self-Awareness** and **Monitoring and Adapting** are “shaded” in the rubrics as a reminder to use them to guide self- and peer-reflections and ongoing conferencing activities with students.
- Unlike most rubrics used today in schools, **all performance level descriptors are stated in the positive to describe what a student CAN do at that level, not what they can’t do** (which makes self-assessment less punitive and more instructive). Positive wording reflects skills that develop over time.
- **Rubric descriptors are cumulative across performance levels:** “I can also...” means that in addition to a lower, adjacent level descriptor, I can also do this.
- **Distinctions between rubric wording used at some lower performance levels:** “with prompting” (teacher directly reminds, intervenes in the moment) versus “with guidance” (teacher models or provides a process to follow).
- **Clarifying rubric wording:** “Evaluating” (identify strengths/weaknesses of progress or decisions) versus “assessing” (using success criteria at the end).
- Each of the 5 components of collaboration has a focus question describing a specific aspect of collaboration. [See table below.] Teachers using these rubrics may choose to teach and assess one or more collaboration component at a given time, as appropriate to the learning task. For example, a teacher might begin with developing communication skills and equitable sharing, before moving from whole class to small group work.

Focus of Each Component	Focus Question for Each Collaboration Component
Equitably Sharing Ideas	COMMUNICATING Do I contribute my ideas clearly, listen respectfully, and encourage the participation of all group members?
Working through Group Differences or Personal Challenges	DECISION-MAKING & PROBLEM SOLVING How do I show that I value perspectives of others and am willing to work with others to resolve conflicts between members or my personal challenges?
Individual & Group Effort Towards Quality	CONTRIBUTING & SUPPORTING Do I contribute to group expectations by providing feedback on the work and ideas of others, completing my tasks, and assessing the quality of our results?
Student Self-Assessment Criterion: Reflecting on My Role in a Group	SELF-AWARENESS & PERSONAL RESPONSIBILITY How am I building on my strengths, interests, and experiences when planning group tasks and working on my part?
Student Peer-Assessment Criterion: Evaluating Group Processes	MONITORING & ADAPTING How do the members of my group evaluate our progress and determine when and how we should modify our approach to benefit the group?

NH Collaboration Rubric for Grades K-2

Collaboration Focus Questions	Extending I can also ...	Applying I can also ...	Developing I can also ...	Emerging I can ...
<p>COMMUNICATING Do I contribute my ideas clearly, listen respectfully, and encourage the participation of all group members?</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Encourage everyone to participate by asking follow-up questions that help the group to better understand ideas or suggestions. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Give suggestions to others and ask for feedback that helps me clarify my ideas. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Answer questions that help me say more about my ideas and ask questions to get more information about the ideas of others (with guidance). 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Take turns speaking, share my ideas, and listen to ideas from each group member (with prompting).
<p>DECISION-MAKING & PROBLEM SOLVING How do I show that I value perspectives of others and am willing to work with others to resolve conflicts between members or my personal challenges?</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Suggest ways that the group might work out a conflict or problem. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Help my group plan and suggest ways to be fair with who does each part or task. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Work with my group to compare how each of our ideas might be different or the same (with guidance). 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Recognize how others feel and try to work out differences when we disagree (with guidance).
<p>CONTRIBUTING & SUPPORTING Do I contribute to group expectations by providing feedback on the work and ideas of others, completing my tasks, and assessing the quality of our results?</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Work with my group to evaluate how we did in meeting group goals and suggest ways to improve the quality of our work next time (with guidance). 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Meet group expectations for contributing and completing my part of the group's work. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Ask for feedback on my ideas and give feedback to others when asked (with guidance). 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Offer my ideas and respond to the ideas of others with a question or personal opinion (with prompting).
<p>Self-Assessment SELF-AWARENESS & PERSONAL RESPONSIBILITY How am I building on my strengths, interests, and experiences when planning group tasks and working on my part?</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Reflect on what I did well, what I'm getting better at, and what I learned from working with my group. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Work with my group to figure out what tasks we each can do to accomplish our shared goal and work to complete my part. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Choose what I will do to help my group meet a goal (with guidance). 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Show that I understand group processes by paying attention and suggesting ways I can help with group tasks (with prompting).
<p>Peer-Assessment MONITORING & ADAPTING How do the members of my group evaluate our progress and determine when and how we should modify our approach to benefit the group?</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Work with my group to suggest ways to improve how we work together as a group (e.g., using a peer conferencing rubric). 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Build on ideas and suggestions of others to improve our group's strategies or plan. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Suggest ideas when my group has a problem and needs to make changes to our plan (with guidance). 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Reflect on my progress and follow guidance from others when I need help (with prompting).

NH Collaboration Rubric for Grades 3-5

Collaboration Focus Questions	Extending I can also ...	Applying I can also ...	Developing I can also ...	Emerging I can ...
COMMUNICATING Do I contribute my ideas clearly, listen respectfully, and encourage the participation of all group members?	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Encourage everyone to participate by asking follow-up questions, giving relevant feedback, or showing appreciation for each person’s contributions. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Provide additional support for my ideas/opinions and ask others to elaborate on their perspectives so I can better understand them. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Clarify or elaborate on my ideas when asked and ask others for more information about their ideas. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Take turns when sharing my ideas, giving suggestions, or listening to ideas shared by others (with prompting).
DECISION-MAKING & PROBLEM SOLVING How do I show that I value perspectives of others and am willing to work with others to resolve conflicts between members or my personal challenges?	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Ask others to share different points of view when we are trying to find a way to resolve a conflict. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Work with my group to agree on how to fairly assign tasks and roles (e.g., figuring out how to use each person’s ideas, strengths, or interests). 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Contribute my ideas to group planning and suggest ways to be fair when deciding on possible tasks (with guidance). 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Compare my ideas to ideas of others and respond to questions that help me understand the similarities or differences (with guidance).
CONTRIBUTING & SUPPORTING Do I contribute to group expectations by providing feedback on the work and ideas of others, completing my tasks, and assessing the quality of our results?	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Work with my group to give each other help and feedback to ensure the quality of our work meets group goals and success criteria. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Meet group expectations for completing my individual tasks and contributing to the quality of my group’s work. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Ask for feedback on my ideas and give feedback to others based on group expectations and planning. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Share my ideas and explain how they could help meet our group’s expectations.
Self-Assessment SELF-AWARENESS & PERSONAL RESPONSIBILITY How am I building on my strengths, interests, and experiences when planning group tasks and working on my part?	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Reflect on what I learned working with my group when I used my strengths and challenged myself. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Work with my group to analyze possible strategies and roles, choose the best approach to accomplish our shared goal, and complete my parts. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Choose my role and work to complete my tasks to help my group meet a shared goal (with guidance). 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Suggest ways I will contribute my strengths to help with group tasks (with prompting).
Peer-Assessment MONITORING & ADAPTING How do the members of my group evaluate our progress and determine when and how we should modify our approach to benefit the group?	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Reflect with my group on progress we made and what we learned from working out problems or challenges together. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Affirm and build on ideas of others and help my group change our plan to improve our strategies or our processes. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Work with my group to identify challenges and look for possible solutions (with guidance). 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Reflect on my progress and reach out to others for feedback when needed (with prompting and guidance).

NH Collaboration Rubric for Grades 6-8

Collaboration Focus Questions	Extending I can also ...	Applying I can also ...	Developing I can also ...	Emerging I can ...
<p>COMMUNICATING Do I contribute my ideas clearly, listen respectfully, and encourage the participation of all group members?</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Contribute well-supported ideas and validate each team member's contributions with positive reinforcement and constructive feedback. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Work with my group to pose questions, seek feedback, and analyze different perspectives in order to modify a position or idea. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Justify my point of view with supporting evidence and pose questions or give feedback to others to clarify their points of view (with guidance). 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Share and elaborate on my perspectives and encourage others to share their perspectives during group dialogue (with prompting).
<p>DECISION-MAKING & PROBLEM SOLVING How do I show that I value perspectives of others and am willing to work with others to resolve conflicts between members or my personal challenges?</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Work with my group to evaluate possible trade-offs and merits of each idea and find a way to resolve conflicts that honor each member's contributions. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Work with my group to build consensus when determining tasks and roles needed to achieve group goals, based on each person's strengths or interests. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Use my understanding of differing perspectives and approaches to develop shared group goals, roles, and tasks. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Follow a process provided by the teacher to advocate for my ideas, consider ideas of others, and work towards group consensus.
<p>CONTRIBUTING & SUPPORTING Do I contribute to group expectations by providing feedback on the work and ideas of others, completing my tasks, and assessing the quality of our results?</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Analyze alternative approaches that could increase my personal learning or advance the overall quality of my group's performance. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Support my group by working to complete individual and group tasks and evaluating the effectiveness of our approach or quality of our final product. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Affirm the efforts and ideas of others and suggest ways to use them to advance group expectations and planning. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Explain how my contributions could help to meet expectations for completing my group's work.
<p>Self-Assessment SELF-AWARENESS & PERSONAL RESPONSIBILITY How am I building on my strengths, interests, and experiences when planning group tasks and working on my part?</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Describe how I contributed my strengths and overcame challenges to improve the quality of my group's final product. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Work with my group to set group goals, analyze possible approaches to accomplish tasks, and assign individual roles that maximize group potential. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Show a commitment to group goals and adjust my responsibilities to ensure that my contributions help my group meet success criteria for quality work (with guidance). 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Draw on past experiences when working with my group to establish norms for group processes and to guide my contributions to group tasks (with guidance).
<p>Peer-Assessment MONITORING & ADAPTING How do the members of my group evaluate our progress and determine when and how we should modify our approach to benefit the group?</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Work with my group to reflect on group progress and adapt norms, roles, or strategies to optimize the collective group effort and advance the overall quality of my group's performance. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Work with my group to analyze challenges, identify the need for different strategies, and adjust our approach to meet individual or group needs. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Contribute ideas and build upon suggestions from others to make possible individual or group course corrections (with guidance). 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Monitor my progress in completing tasks and work through challenges with help from others.

NH Collaboration Rubric for Grades 9-12

Collaboration Focus Questions	Extending I can also ...	Applying I can also ...	Developing I can also ...	Emerging I can ...
<p>COMMUNICATING Do I contribute my ideas clearly, listen respectfully, and encourage the participation of all group members?</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Contribute well-supported ideas and validate each team member's contributions with positive reinforcement and constructive feedback. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Pose direct follow-up questions, seek relevant feedback, and evaluate different perspectives in order to modify, or strengthen a position or idea. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Justify my point of view with supporting evidence and pose questions or give relevant feedback to others to help them clarify their points of view. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Share and elaborate on my perspectives and encourage others to clarify their perspectives during group dialogue.
<p>DECISION-MAKING & PROBLEM SOLVING How do I show that I value perspectives of others and am willing to work with others to resolve conflicts between members or my personal challenges?</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Work with my group to evaluate the effects of decisions made to resolve conflicts in terms of honoring each member's contributions and strengthening group cohesiveness. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Resolve potential group conflicts by refining my position or seeking a compromise that builds on the group's best ideas. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Work with my group to build consensus when our group encounters problems or has differing viewpoints (e.g., determining tasks or roles based on strengths or interests) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Follow an established process provided to advocate for my ideas, consider ideas of others, and work towards group consensus.
<p>CONTRIBUTING & SUPPORTING Do I contribute to group expectations by providing feedback on the work and ideas of others, completing my tasks, and assessing the quality of our results?</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Analyze alternative approaches that could increase my personal learning or advance the overall quality of my group's performance. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Complete my individual tasks, and work with my group to evaluate the effort and quality of our contributions in meeting established group goals. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Affirm the efforts, ideas, and contributions of team members and give constructive feedback based on group expectations and planning. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Identify my individual contributions and justify how they could help to meet specific group needs or goals.
<p>Self-Assessment SELF-AWARENESS & PERSONAL RESPONSIBILITY How am I building on my strengths, interests, and experiences when planning group tasks and working on my part?</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Analyze how my roles and responsibilities within the group dynamics demonstrated individual responsibility and enhanced group equity. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Work with my group to adapt approaches and overcome potential challenges to accomplish a shared goal and maximize group potential. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Work with my group to analyze our approach and plan out equitable tasks so that each member's contributions help the group meet success criteria for work quality (with guidance). 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Work with my group to set group goals and roles, establish norms for group processes, and identify or adapt my contributions to meet group needs (with guidance).
<p>Peer-Assessment MONITORING & ADAPTING How do the members of my group evaluate our progress and determine when and how we should modify our approach to benefit the group?</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Work with my group to reflect on progress and adapt group norms, roles, or strategies to optimize the collective group effort and enhance a positive group dynamic. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Work with my group to evaluate group progress and needs, seek solutions, and reassign responsibilities to troubleshoot problems. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Work with my group to identify potential challenges or the need to adjust our approach in order to meet individual or group needs. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Identify models, approaches, or support that will help me to overcome barriers in completing my tasks and work through challenges (with guidance).